Progress in Social Development

THE REPRESENTATION OF CONTESTED PERSPECTIVES IN THE FILM *NAGABONAR JADI 2*: A STUDY OF SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT

Dumanita Tamba[1], Wahyu Pratama Tamba[2]
[1] Universitas Nusa Cendana, Indonesia
[2] Doctorate Program of Social Welfare Studies, Universitas Indonesia, Indonesia

Email Correspondence: wahyu.pratama32@ui.ac.id

ABSTRACT:
Film, as an entertainment and educational medium, has a unique role in reflecting social reality. Although the film "Nagabonar Jadi 2" explicitly features a variety of social issues, an in-depth understanding of the underlying dynamics and their implications for social development is often not fully articulated. This research chooses a descriptive qualitative approach in abstracting and analyzing the film, using scene and storyline observations and the theoretical framework of social development. This research highlights the absence of social development reflections in Indonesian films as a medium for critical education of society. The analysis shows that the film effectively represents the contestation of fundamental views between traditional values (Nagabonar) and modernity (Bonaga). This contestation is manifested in issues such as land use conflict (family grave), urban-rural divide, access to education, cultural shift, and public service integrity. The discovery that these social issues are more appropriately identified as "contestation of perspectives" is a distinct contribution to the field of social development studies, offering a new perspective in analyzing films as objects of development studies. From a social development perspective, this contestation underscores the urgency of a holistic approach, respect for local wisdom, enhancement of human and social capital, and public-private synergy for an inclusive and equitable development.

Keywords: Nagabonar Jadi 2, Contested Perspective, Social Problem, Social Development

1.   INTRODUCTION

As a developing country, Indonesia continues to face challenges in realizing equitable and sustainable social development for all its people. Social development, at its core, is a planned collective effort to address various social problems and improve the quality of life and welfare of the community in a comprehensive manner. In this context, film as an audio-visual medium has a unique role in reflecting, educating, and presenting a factual picture of complex social problems that occur in the midst of people's lives. Movies can function as a 'mirror' of social reality and at the same time become an important medium for conveying moral and educational messages about the dynamics of community life.

The film "Nagabonar Jadi 2", which was released in 2007 and became one of the best-selling films of its time, is a work that successfully depicts in depth various social issues relevant to the dynamics of development in Indonesia. The film's success was marked by ticket sales reaching 2.4 million viewers (Aji, 2013). The movie tells the dilemma of a father named Nagabonar, a veteran freedom fighter, who faces the plan of his son, Bonaga, a successful businessman in Jakarta, to build a factory on his oil palm plantation in his hometown, where there is a family ancestral grave. The conflict between Bonaga's modern-economic development vision and Nagabonar's deeply held traditional and historical values implicitly highlights the contestations and challenges in the process of social development itself. Specifically, this research focuses on the social development issues raised in the movie "Nagabonar Jadi 2". This study is motivated to analyze how this film clearly shows the role of other parties outside the local community, in this case the private sector represented

by Bonaga in efforts to improve the capacity and quality of life of the community, which often confronts local values and social conditions.

Although many films have been analyzed in relation to common social issues such as inequality, poverty, or access to education, the film "Nagabonar Jadi 2" offers a new perspective through its depiction of the role of local leadership and the spirit of nationalism in facing social development challenges that distinguish it from the focus of previous film studies. Nagabonar's nationalism is shown by a sense of appreciation as well as respect for the services of heroes and state symbols (Abidin, 2017). Therefore, the main research question to be answered in this study is how does the film "Nagabonar Jadi 2" represent and depict complex social development issues, and how does this representation have implications for understanding the dynamics of development oriented towards community welfare?

2. METHOD

This research uses a qualitative approach with a descriptive research type to explore and understand the representation of social development issues in the film "Nagabonar Jadi 2". The reason the qualitative approach was chosen is because it allows researchers to uncover deeper meanings of complex phenomena, such as social problems and development dynamics depicted in the movie. According to Babbie (2004), qualitative methods aim to obtain rich and descriptive data to understand experiences and behaviors. Meanwhile, descriptive research serves to describe social phenomena that are happening relevantly in the context of social development, as stated by Sugiyono (2011). The main research object is the film "Nagabonar Jadi 2". This movie was chosen because it is considered to contain many important social issues and educational value in the context of social development.

Furthermore, data collection techniques were carried out in two main ways, first, researchers made in-depth and repeated observations of each scene and storyline in the film "Nagabonar Jadi 2". The focus of observation is to identify and record visual elements and dialogues that represent or indicate issues of social development, contestation of perspectives, gaps, or interactions between actors (individuals, communities, private sector, government) related to development. For example, the conflict between Nagabonar and Bonaga's views on land use and traditional values became the focus of observation to understand development dynamics. Second, literature review, data collected from film observations were supported and analyzed by conducting an extensive literature review on theories and concepts relevant to social development, as well as related social issues. This included the social development theories of Paiva, Jones and Pandey, Midgley, as well as concepts of social problems as defined by Rubington & Weinberg (2002).

Data analysis techniques are thematic and interpretative. The data that has been collected from observation of film scenes and literature review is then analyzed qualitatively with the following steps: First, identifying and grouping scenes or dialogues that explicitly or implicitly depict social issues relevant to development, such as differences in views due to the education gap, urban-rural gap, access to education, cultural issues, and public services. Second, analyzing each category of social issue by interpreting it in the context of social development theory. For example, how the conflict between Nagabonar and Bonaga reflects the contestation between traditional values and modernity in development, or how the interaction between characters shows the role of various parties in efforts to improve the capacity and quality of life of the community. The analysis also includes how these issues have implications for understanding the dynamics of development oriented towards community welfare. Third, synthesizing the findings from the film with social development concepts and theories to present a comprehensive picture of how the film "Nagabonar Jadi 2" represents complex social development issues, and what it contributes to the understanding of these dynamics.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The film "Nagabonar Jadi 2" successfully represents the complexity of social development through a narrative rich in contested perspectives. This movie is not just entertainment, but a strong reflection of how social, economic and cultural changes interact with each other, and how development efforts must consider various dimensions to achieve inclusive and sustainable welfare. Regarding films as material for analysis, it is conceptually explained by Effendy (2003) in Tunziyah and Ri'aeni (2019) that films are audio-visual media that function as important mass media in delivering one or more messages to the public. Some of the messages conveyed from a movie include information, education, and entertainment. This film shows how the characters, such as Nagabonar and Bonaga, despite having different backgrounds and views, collectively contribute to our understanding of the challenges and opportunities in social development, confirming that movies can be an invaluable means of understanding these dynamics.

3.1 Representation of contestation and social development dynamics in the film "Nagabonar Jadi 2"

This research identifies five main issues in the film "Nagabonar Jadi 2" that represent the contestation and dynamics of social development. These issues are not just separate problems, but are interrelated in describing the complexity of development oriented towards community welfare. First, regarding the contestation of physical development with cultural and historical values, the film explicitly depicts the conflict between Bonaga's resort/factory development plan and the historical and cultural values upheld by Nagabonar. Bonaga's plan to displace three family graves for a two trillion rupiah business profit is strongly opposed by Nagabonar who interprets it as a loss of history and ancestral heritage. Although Monita and her team offer three solutions, including preserving the tombs with the construction of a park around them, this opposition reflects a universal dilemma in development: how to integrate economic progress without sacrificing local identity and values. Nagabonar's anger towards Japanese investors also adds a historical dimension to the contestation of the values of nationalism and patriotism.

The second, there is a social divide and spatial divide, (urban-rural divide). This can be seen from the beginning of his arrival, Nagabonar is stunned by the luxuries of Jakarta, such as billboards and four-wheeled vehicles, which contrast with the other side of the city such as densely populated settlements, informal professions (Metromini drivers, Bajaj), and the apathy of city residents towards social problems. The scene of the sick grandmother stuck in traffic and ignored by other drivers before being intervened by Nagabonar sharply highlights the disparity of life in the capital city and other areas, as well as the negative impact of physical growth that is not accompanied by attention to quality of life and social care. Third, regarding access to education and its implications for social mobility, the movie depicts the conditions of differences in access and quality of education between generations. Bonaga, who managed to get a master's degree abroad, was able to achieve success as a businessman in Jakarta. In contrast, Nagabonar, who never completed his education and could not even read or write, reflects the limited access to education and services in the previous generation. This difference becomes one of the important factors that shape the different outlooks and life opportunities of the two characters, emphasizing that education is an important factor in social development.

Fourth, there is a shift and conflict of cultural values between generations. In addition to the tomb issue, the movie also depicts a broader clash of cultures. Nagabonar's perspective of the tomb as an irreplaceable ancestral heritage confronts Bonaga's pragmatic view of it as an object that can be moved for profit. The hedonistic lifestyle of the city people, such as seeking nightlife in discotheques and the phenomenon of "reserved" restaurant tables that leaves Nagabonar confused, further illustrates the cultural clash between the two generations and the influence of modern consumerism on social values. Fifth, there is the problem of the dilemma of public service and bureaucratic integrity, that this movie displays the reality of bureaucracy and public services that are tainted by corrupt practices. The dialogue between Monita and Bonaga regarding the practice of tax evasion by Bonaga's company which has an impact on the neglected infrastructure development represents the issue of public services. This shows the negative synergy between the private sector and the bureaucracy that hampers equitable national development.

3.2 Contestation of perspective in the film "Nagabonar Jadi 2"

The film "Nagabonar Jadi 2" nicely presents various contestations of perspective that are at the core of the dynamics of social development. The movie serves as a strong object of study to understand how various issues such as economy, culture, education, and governance are intertwined in the process of community development. A thematic analysis of the scenes and dialogues in the film shows that the issues identified above are not merely individual problems, but rather reflections of the tensions between different values in the pursuit of prosperity.

The conflict between Bonaga and Nagabonar over the construction of a factory on the family graveyard is a manifestation of the contestation between economic development and socio-cultural development strategies. Paiva's (in Payne, 2005) view of social development as focusing on individual and community capacity building, as well as Midgley's (1995) notion of social development as progressive change that incorporates human rights and social justice, as opposed to the dominance of economic development, are particularly relevant here. Nagabonar represents traditional values and local wisdom that reject innovations that violate social and moral beliefs, as argued by Bandura (1977). This confirms the urgency of aligning social policies with economic development goals and the importance of considering cultural assets as community capital in development. The movie serves as a reminder for the government and society to integrate and balance physical development with social, economic and cultural policies for sustainable and welfare-oriented development.

Ideally, regional development is accompanied by inclusiveness and equity in development programs. However, the disparity of life between the capital city and the regions, as well as the phenomenon of urban

apathy, illustrate the challenges in achieving social equality, which is the goal of distributive strategies in social development (Pandey in Payne, 2005). The scene of the sick grandmother stuck in traffic and ignored shows that massive physical development without increased social care can create new problems. This underscores the importance of social policies designed to meet people's needs and aid their survival, as Reisman (2001) states. The movie reminds us that true development should involve improving the quality of life of the whole community, not just a section or group of people.

Furthermore, the difference in education levels between Nagabonar and Bonaga directly reflects the importance of human development strategies aimed at improving the skills and capacity of communities to act on their own behalf in improving the economic and institutional development of their areas (Pandey in Payne, 2005). The limited access to education in Nagabonar's generation impacts their participation in modern development dynamics.

Then, the visualization of the contestation of cultural values around tombs and urban lifestyles shows that social development is not only about structural or economic changes, but also about how people adapt and maintain their cultural identity in the midst of modernization. The film implicitly challenges the notion that development always means the sacrifice of traditional values. Instead, it emphasizes the need for development that is oriented towards the preservation of local culture and social welfare. This is in line with the concept of cultural capital as a community asset that can generate important benefits for the entire community if invested locally.

Finally, it highlights governance and responsibility in ensuring welfare. The issue of public services and corrupt practices emphasizes the importance of institutional development in social development (Jones & Pandey in Payne, 2005). Social development requires social institutions that are able to meet people's needs more precisely and accountably. Monita's criticism of tax avoidance practices resulting in neglected infrastructure points to governance failures that have a direct impact on people's welfare.

3.3   The contestation of perspective analysis in the film and its implications for social development

3.3.1   Between tradition and modernization

The film "Nagabonar Jadi 2" straightforwardly displays the conflict between Nagabonar, who upholds traditional values and respect for ancestral graves, and Bonaga, who is oriented towards modern economic development through the construction of factories/resorts. This contestation, in which Nagabonar considers the eviction of the tombs as "a form of erasure of the history of their family and ancestors", reflects the incompatibility between the values of the local community and the existing development plan. From a social development perspective, this situation underscores the importance of integrating physical development with social, economic and cultural policies. Paiva (in Payne, 2005) emphasizes that social development must involve structural change and socio-economic integration, as well as the development of institutions capable of meeting human needs and aspirations. The contestation over the tomb shows a failure to create harmony between the economic needs of Bonaga and investors with the social and cultural needs of Nagabonar and the local community.

As stated by Bandura (1977), human behavior is influenced by the consequences of others' behavior, and people tend to reject innovations that violate their social and moral beliefs. Nagabonar's rejection of development projects that ignore tombs is a manifestation of the rejection of innovations that sacrifice noble values. This analysis is also relevant to the concept of community assets proposed by Green (2010) and Adi (2008), where tombs and the values attached to them can be viewed as cultural or spiritual capital that should be maintained and integrated in social development strategies, not eliminated. Development should not be at the expense of the local environment or important values held dear by the community.

3.3.2   Social inequality and access to development

The film visually depicts the stark disparity of life between the capital city of Jakarta and the regions, which gives rise to a contestation of perspective between Nagabonar who is appalled by the opulence and apathy of Jakarta, and Bonaga who lives within the metropolis. This disparity manifests in various aspects, including experiential differences in access to public facilities (for example, bajajs are prohibited from crossing protocol roads) and social phenomena such as traffic jams that impede emergency access for the weak.

This explanation is in line with the theme of social inequality that has also been raised in other film research, such as in the film "Parasite" which identifies gaps in education, housing, and opportunity as a result of the capitalist economy. From a social development perspective, these disparities point to the need for distributive strategies that aim to improve social equality between groups nationwide (Pandey in Payne, 2005). The disparities in the movie also highlight the importance of a more equitable development that is capable of providing a breath of fresh air to the dynamic process of social change (Suaib, 2023).

This contestation also extends to access to education. The difference in education levels between Nagabonar (unable to read or write) and Bonaga (a graduate from a foreign university) is clearly depicted. The film shows how higher education gives Bonaga greater access to economic and business opportunities, while Nagabonar's limited education reflects access barriers in previous generations and its impact on participation in social development. This is in line with human development strategies that aim to improve people's skills and capacity to act on their own behalf (Pandey in Payne, 2005), as well as strategies to increase human capital through education (Midgley, 2014).

3.3.3 Integrity and governance in public service

The film also presents contestations relating to integrity in public service, particularly through the practice of corruption and tax evasion by businessmen like Bonaga. Monita, Bonaga's colleague, directly criticizes these practices that cause "The government has difficulty building infrastructure, many roads and infrastructure are abandoned due to the lack of state revenue funds". This contestation displays the dilemma between the private profit motives of entrepreneurs and the broader goal of social development.

From a social development perspective, this issue is crucial because social development is promoted through the role of the Government with its specialized agents, policy makers and administrators who are responsible for promoting the welfare of all citizens (Midgley, 2005). Corrupt practices hinder the state's ability to meet the needs of society through the design and delivery of social policies (Reisman, 2001). The film serves as a reminder for various parties, including the Government and the private sector, to work together to create a development model that is oriented towards social welfare and preservation of local culture, not just oriented towards economic growth. It also emphasizes the need for careful social planning, including social impact assessments, involving both businesses and local governments to ensure development is not at the expense of local communities or their benefits.

4. CONCLUSION

The film "Nagabonar Jadi 2" complexly and deeply represents "contestation of perspectives" as a central issue in the dynamics of social development in Indonesia. An analysis of the film shows that the fundamental differences between traditional values and modernity, demonstrated by Nagabonar and Bonaga, emerge in various social dimensions: from conflicts over land use and the existence of family tombs, the disparity between the realities of urban and rural life, to different views on access to and the role of education, as well as cultural issues and public services. From a social development perspective, this contestation emphasizes the need for a holistic and integrated approach, the issue of the location of Nagabonar's family tomb and Bonaga's factory development plan highlight the importance of respecting local wisdom and cultural capital in development planning, ensuring investments also consider social goals in addition to financial returns. The disparities in living in the capital city and the regions, as well as the differences in access to education seen in the movie, demonstrate the urgency of a social development strategy that focuses on improving human capital and developing social capital. Higher education can open up economic opportunities, but limited education also reflects the challenges of development participation. Furthermore, the problem of corruption in public services reminds us that careful social planning and synergy between government and business are essential to ensure inclusive development, maintain community welfare, and preserve local culture.

Compared to previous film studies that highlight poverty or injustice in general, this research has a key difference by highlighting the role of local leadership and the spirit of the independence struggle as a lens to understand the dynamics of social development. As a reflection of this analysis, the movie "Nagabonar Jadi 2" serves as an important reminder for various parties-government, private sector, and society-to implement sustainable development by integrating social, economic, and cultural policies in a balanced manner. In the face of contesting perspective in the real world, implementing development strategies that involve active community participation, identification of local assets, and comprehensive social planning will ensure that development is always oriented towards improving social welfare and preserving cultural values, not just economic growth. For future research, it is very important to continue to deepen the analysis related to the representation of social development issues in other films with different backgrounds, both local and international films. Conducting studies with a comparative approach between international and local films that raise similar issues can provide in-depth knowledge about the interpretation and analysis of social development from various contexts and cultures.

REFERENCES

Abidin, Z. (2017). Representasi Nasionalisme dalam Film Nagabonar Jadi 2. Jurnal Politikom Indonesiana, 2(1), 42-61. https://interoperabilitas.perpusnas.go.id/

Adi, I. R. (2008). Intervensi Komunitas & Pengembangan Masyarakat: Sebagai Upaya Pemberdayaan Masyarakat. Jakarta: PT Raja Grafindo Persada.

Aji, F. (2013). Studi Estetika Film Nagabonar Jadi 2 Karya Deddy Mizwar. Tesis Program Pascasarjana ISI Surakarta.

Arastone A., Fathoni E., Arsyandodi I., Harisman F. (2023). Analisis Fenomena Permasalahan Sosial Pada Film Alangkah Lucunya (Negeri Ini). Prosiding Seminar Nasional Desain dan Media, 998-1008.

Babbie, E. (2004). The Practice of Social Research. USA: Wadsworth Thomson Learning Inc.

Bandura, A. 1977. Social Learning Theory. London: Prentice-Hall, Inc.

Deddy Mizwar. 2007. Nagabonar Jadi 2 [Film]. Jakarta: PT Demi Gisela Citra Sinema.

Green, G. P. (2010). Mobilizing Communities Asset Building as a Community Development Strategy. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

Hutabarat E., E. & Yuwono A., P. (2024). Analisis Semiotika Representasi Kemiskinan Pada Film Sedeng Sang. Harmoni: Jurnal Ilmu Komunikasi dan Sosial, 2(1), 185-197. https://doi.org/10.59581/harmoni-widyakarya.v2i1.2549

Midgley, J. (1995). Social Development: The Developmental Perspective in Social Welfare. London: SAGE Publication.

Midgley, James. (2014). Social Development: Theory & Practice. London: SAGE Publication.

Patmawati, Hamdan, Masyhadiah. (2021). Representasi Kesenjangan Sosial Dalam Film Parasite (Analisis Semiotika Roland Barthes). MITZAL (Demokrasi, Komunikasi, dan Budaya). Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan & Ilmu Komunikasi, 5(2),171-182. http://dx.doi.org/10.35329/mitzal.v5i2.1896

Payne, M. (2014). Modern Social Work Theory. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Purwowibowo. (2018). Pembangunan Sosial. Jakarta: Penerbit Melvana.

Puspasari, C. (2017). Globalisasi Dalam Film Indonesia: Interpretasi Budaya dalam Film Naga Bonar dan Naga Bonar Jadi 2. CoverAge: Journal of Strategic Communication, 8 1), 12-25.

Reisman, D. (2001). Welfare and society. Basingstoke: Palgrave

Rubington, E., & Weinberg, M. S. (2002). The Study of Social Problems: Seven perspectives (7th ed.). New York: Oxford University Press.

Suaib. (2023). Pembangunan dan Pemberdayaan Masyarakat. Indramayu: Penerbit Adab.

Sugiyono. (2011). Metode Penelitian Kualitatif dan Kuantitatif. Bandung: Alfabeta.

Tunziyah & Ri'aeni, I. (2019). Analisis Wacana Kritis Konstruksi Konflik Keluarga dalam Film Cek Toko Sebelah. Jurnal Lontar Universitas Serang Raya, 7(1), 71-88. https://doi.org/10.30656/lontar.v7i1.1571

Widiyanto, R.D dkk. (2024). Analisis Gambaran Kondisi Pembangunan Dalam Film "13 Bom di Jakarta": Tinjauan Keterbelakangan Pembangunan. WISSEN: Jurnal Ilmu Sosial Dan Humaniora, 2(3), 56–64. https://doi.org/10.62383/wissen.v2i3.170